

# MODEL REVIEW CHECKLIST

## Process checklist for the review of HE models

The following checklist is intended to serve as a tool to ensure appropriate economic model review, but should not be considered to be a definitive statement of, nor a comprehensive list of tasks to support the model review process. A checklist is useful in so far as it provides a systematic approach to model review and focuses the reviewer on the model’s strengths and weaknesses.

## Model structure

TASK	Where to find in TreeAge Pro
Confirm accuracy of model structure/ Clinical pathways validation against model specification document or dossier report: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Review model disease/treatment pathways</li> <li>• Validate clinical assumptions</li> <li>• Identify the Model Type:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Cohort</li> <li>- Patient Level Simulation (PLS)</li> <li>- Discrete Event Simulation</li> <li>- Partitioned Survival</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	Visual Tree Editor Dashboard (Review all 3 tabs)

## Model inputs and assumptions

TASK	Where to find in TreeAge Pro
Confirm inputs are consistent with model assumptions: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Clinical trial endpoints (or observed outcomes) to be used are in line with clinical assumptions in the model</li> <li>- Numerical data is in line with report and/or consistent with evidence</li> </ul>	Visual Tree Editor Variable Properties View
Ensure model inputs are relevant: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- All probabilities are between 0 and 1</li> <li>- All probabilities following each chance nodes sum to 1</li> <li>- Efficacy and safety input data</li> <li>- HRQL/HSUV data</li> <li>- HRU/cost data</li> <li>- All relevant outcomes included</li> <li>- All relevant events incorporated in model (e.g., side effects)</li> <li>- Model inputs correspond to model time units. (e.g., monthly, annual, etc.)</li> <li>- Parameter uncertainty for PSA (Distributions sampled by EV) Does the mean value of the EV distribution(s) reflect the base case?</li> </ul>	Visual Tree Editor Variable Properties View Tables View Distributions View Tree Properties View

## MODEL REVIEW CHECKLIST

TASK	Where to find in TreeAge Pro
<p>Examine Patient-Level Simulation inputs and ouTreeAge Pro uts (if appropriate):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Examine trackers included to capture disease or treatment-related events (e.g., hospitalization, stroke event, etc)?</li> <li>- Review patient characteristics (Distributions sampled by trial)</li> </ul>	<p>Tracker Properties View</p> <p>Distributions View</p>
<p>Review Model Setup:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Basis for decision (e.g., Cost-effectiveness)</li> <li>- Primary OuTreeAge Pro uts from Analysis</li> <li>- Costs and outcomes discounted appropriately</li> </ul>	<p>Dashboard</p> <p>Tree Prefs &gt; Calculation &gt; Calculation Method</p> <p>Tree Prefs &gt; Calculation &gt; Payoffs</p> <p>Tree Prefs &gt; Calculation &gt; Payoffs &gt; Discounting</p>
<p>Markov models:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Markov cycle length is consistent and supports research question</li> <li>- Time horizon sufficient to reflect differences in cost and effectiveness (and other outcomes)</li> </ul>	<p>Markov Info View (all tabs)</p> <p>[Select each appropriate Markov node]</p>

### Running the model

TASK	Where to find in TreeAge Pro
<p>Cost-Effectiveness Analysis (Base Case):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Run CEA; do ICER results match report?</li> <li>- Are outcomes consistent for each strategy?</li> </ul>	<p>Analysis &gt; Rankings</p>
<p>Markov Cohort calculations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Run Markov Cohort Report for each Markov process.</li> <li>- Check that cohort membership over time accurately represents disease progression.</li> <li>- Check outcomes (cost, utility, etc.) calculations cycle by cycle.</li> <li>- Convert any TreeAge Pro Markov model to an Excel model and can use the strategy detail sheets to review calculations</li> <li>- Manually calculate 2-3 cycles of disease progression and check against cohort report.</li> </ul>	<p>Markov Cohort Extended Report</p> <p>[Select Markov node before running]</p> <p>Markov To Excel Export function (Markov models only)</p> <p>[Select Root Node if all strategies are Markov. Otherwise, select individual Markov nodes.]</p>
<p>Patient-Level Simulation (Monte Carlo)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Run simulation; generate and review CEA for ICER, as described above.</li> <li>- Turn on patient tracking to review Markov cohort details as described above.</li> <li>- Turn on seeding to generate repeatable results.</li> </ul>	<p>Analysis &gt; Monte Carlo Simulation &gt; Trials</p> <p>From simulation output:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- CEA &gt; Rankings.</li> <li>- Patient Tracking cohort report.</li> </ul> <p>Tree Preferences &gt; Monte Carlo Options &gt; Patient Tracking Selection (Check the box for Patient Tracking)</p> <p>Tree Preferences &gt; Monte Carlo Options &gt; Random Number Seeding Options</p>
<p>Partitioned Survival Analysis</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Review survival curves.</li> <li>- Review progression, costs and effectiveness over time.</li> </ul>	<p>Analysis &gt; PartSA &gt; Survival Curves</p> <p>Analysis &gt; PartSA &gt; Time Report</p>

# MODEL REVIEW CHECKLIST

## Uncertainty (Sensitivity Analysis)

TASK	Where to find in TreeAge Pro
<p><b>Analyze deterministic uncertainty results:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Do the base case and sensitivity/scenario analysis results make logical and intuitive sense?</li> <li>- Are they consistent with the input data?</li> <li>- Are they within reasonable ranges of the input data?</li> <li>- Are all important variables explored?</li> <li>- Are the ranges in values evidence-based and reasonable?</li> <li>- Can I reproduce deterministic results from the report?</li> <li>- Run several one-way sensitivity analysis (OWSA) calculations</li> <li>- Run tornado diagram</li> </ul>	<p>Analysis &gt; Sensitivity Analysis &gt; 1-way            Analysis &gt; Sensitivity Analysis &gt; Tornado            Scenario Export to Excel tool</p>
<p><b>Analyze probabilistic uncertainty results:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Does each distribution reflect an appropriate range of uncertainty for the parameter?</li> <li>- Run the PSA</li> <li>- Are the results consistent with the report?</li> <li>- Turn on seeding to generate repeatable results</li> </ul>	<p>Distributions View            Analysis &gt; MC Sim &gt; Sampling (Cohort Model)            Analysis &gt; MC Sim &gt; Sampling &amp; Trials (Patient-Level Simulation)            Tree Preferences &gt; Monte Carlo Options &gt; Random Number Seeding Options</p>

## Model Validity and Extreme Value Testing

TASK	Where to find in TreeAge Pro
<p><b>Model Input Tests:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Change each parameter one at a time and confirm target outputs change as expected.</li> </ul>	<p>Variable Properties View            Run model</p>
<p><b>Run the model using Extreme Values for each strategy:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Set drug cost inputs to zero. Drug costs should be zero in the results.</li> <li>- Set other resource use costs to zero. Total costs should reflect only drug costs.</li> <li>- Set efficacy to zero. Survival should be 0.</li> <li>- Set QALY weights to 1.0. QALYs and LY outcomes should be the same.</li> <li>- Set AE risk to zero. No AE costs or QALY impact should occur.</li> <li>- Set discount rates to 0. All outcomes impacted by discounting should match baseline, non-discounted outcomes values.</li> <li>- Set discount rates to 10%. All benefits and costs should decrease</li> </ul>	<p>Variable Properties            Rankings Report (Re-run analysis)            Markov Cohort Extended Report (Re-run analysis)            -OR- Markov to Excel Export function (Markov models only)</p>